

СИБИРСКИЕ ЭЛЕКТРОННЫЕ  
МАТЕМАТИЧЕСКИЕ ИЗВЕСТИЯ

Siberian Electronic Mathematical Reports

<http://semr.math.nsc.ru>

---

*Том 10, стр. 414–417 (2013)*

УДК 512.542

MSC 20D20

ON  $p$ -COMPLEMENTS OF FINITE GROUPS

A.A.BUTURLAKIN, D.O.REVIN

ABSTRACT. A subgroup  $H$  of a finite group  $G$  is called a  $p$ -complement for a prime  $p$ , if the order of  $H$  is not divided by  $p$  and the index  $|G : H|$  is a power of  $p$ . We give examples of a finite group that possesses two nonisomorphic  $p$ -complements and of a finite group in which all  $p$ -complements are isomorphic but not conjugate in the automorphism group.

**Keywords:** finite group,  $p$ -complement.

## INTRODUCTION

In the paper the term “group” always means “finite group”,  $p$  is a prime number.

A subgroup  $H$  of a group  $G$  is called a  $p$ -complement, if there exists a Sylow  $p$ -subgroup  $P$  of  $G$  such that  $H \cap P = 1$  and  $G = HP$ .

The existence of a  $p$ -complement yields important information about structure of the groups. For example, the well-known Chunikhin – Hall theorem [1–3], see also [4, Theorems 3.13 and 3.15], states that a finite group is soluble if and only if it possesses a  $p$ -complement for every prime number  $p$ . Also all  $p$ -complements are conjugate in this case [4, Theorem 3.14].

In an insoluble group,  $p$ -complements can be not conjugate. For example, in group  $\mathrm{GL}_3(2)$  of order  $168 = 2^3 \cdot 3 \cdot 7$  the stabilizer  $H$  of a line and the stabilizer  $K$  of a plane of the natural module are nonconjugate 7-complements (for more details see section 1). On the other hand, subgroups  $H$  and  $K$  are conjugate in the automorphism group of  $\mathrm{GL}_3(2)$ .

---

BUTURLAKIN, A.A., REVIN, D.O., ON  $p$ -COMPLEMENTS OF FINITE GROUPS.

© 2013 BUTURLAKIN, A.A., REVIN, D.O..

The work is supported by the Russian Foundation for Basic Research (grants 11-01-00456, 12-01-31221, and 13-01-00505), by the Federal Target Program “Scientific and Educational Personnel of Innovation Russia” for 2009–2013 (State Contract 14.740.11.0346), and by the Target program of SB RAS for 2012–2014 (integration project No. 14).

*Received March, 14, 2013, published May, 6, 2013.*

V.D. Mazurov noted that the following questions are of some interest in connection with the Chunikhin – Hall theorem.

- (1) Are any two  $p$ -complements of a finite group isomorphic?
- (2) Are any two  $p$ -complements of a finite group conjugate in the automorphism group?

Note two corollaries of the classification of finite simple groups, giving affirmative answers to the questions (1) and (2) in some important cases.

**Proposition 1.** *Let  $G$  be a finite simple group and  $p$  be a prime number. If  $H$  and  $K$  are  $p$ -complements of  $G$ , then  $K = H^\varphi$  for some  $\varphi \in \text{Aut}(G)$ .*

**Proposition 2.** *In a finite group, 2-complements are conjugate.*

The validity of Proposition 1 follows from [5, Corollary 5.3] and Lemma 1 (see below). Proposition 2 is proved in [6, Corollary 4.5].

In the paper we show that there exist groups with nonisomorphic  $p$ -complements and with isomorphic  $p$ -complements which are not conjugate in the automorphism group. Thus the answers to the questions (1) and (2) are negative in general.

Nevertheless, Proposition 2 implies that there exist primes  $p$  such that in every finite group any two  $p$ -complements are conjugate (in particular, they are isomorphic and conjugate in the automorphism group). It would be interesting to find all prime numbers  $p$  such that in every finite group  $G$

- (1) any two  $p$ -complements are conjugate,
- (2) any two  $p$ -complements are conjugate in the automorphism group,
- (3) any two  $p$ -complements are isomorphic.

The following lemma is well-known and is a simple corollary of elementary facts from linear algebra.

**Lemma 1.** *Let  $V$  be a vector space of finite dimension over a finite field  $F$  and  $G = \text{GL}(V)$ . Let  $U$  and  $W$  be subspaces of  $V$ . Put*

$$H = \{g \in G \mid U^g = U\} \text{ and } K = \{g \in G \mid W^g = W\}.$$

*Then*

- (1) *the subgroups  $H$  and  $K$  are conjugate in  $G$  if and only if  $\dim U = \dim W$ ;*
- (2) *if  $\dim U + \dim W = \dim V$ , then the subgroups  $H$  and  $K$  are conjugate in  $\text{Aut}(G)$ .*

*In particular, if  $\dim V > 2$ , then stabilizers of line and hyperplane are not conjugate in  $G$ , but they are conjugate in  $\text{Aut}(G)$ .*

## 1. EXAMPLE OF NONISOMORPHIC $p$ -COMPLEMENTS

Let  $V$  be a three-dimensional vector space over the field  $\mathbb{F}_2$  and  $G = \text{GL}(V) \simeq \text{GL}_3(2)$ . Let  $U$  and  $W$  be subspaces of  $V$  of dimensions 1 and 2 respectively. Put

$$H = \{g \in G \mid U^g = U\} \text{ and } K = \{g \in G \mid W^g = W\}.$$

Denote by  $G^*$  the natural semidirect product of  $V$  and  $G$ . Put  $H^* = \langle V, H \rangle$  and  $K^* = \langle V, K \rangle$ . Let us show that the subgroups  $H^*$  and  $K^*$  are nonisomorphic 7-complements of  $G^*$ .

We have  $|G| = 168 = 2^3 \cdot 7 \cdot 3$ . Obviously, matrices of elements of the groups  $H$  and  $K$  have the following form in bases of  $V$  containing bases of  $U$  and  $W$ , respectively:

$$\left( \begin{array}{c|c} A & \\ \hline * & * \\ \hline & 1 \end{array} \right) \text{ and } \left( \begin{array}{c|c} 1 & \\ \hline * & \\ \hline * & A \end{array} \right),$$

where  $A \in \text{GL}_2(2)$ . Thus  $|H| = |K| = 2^2 \cdot |\text{GL}_2(2)| = 2^3 \cdot 3$  and  $|G : H| = |G : K| = 7$ . Hence  $|H^*| = |K^*| = 2^6 \cdot 3$  and  $|G^* : H^*| = |G^* : K^*| = 7$ . Therefore,  $H^*$  and  $K^*$  are 7-complements of  $G^*$ . We are going to show that  $H^*$  and  $K^*$  are nonisomorphic.

Note that  $U$  contains a unique nonzero vector  $u$ . Hence  $u^h = u$  for every  $h \in H$  and we have  $u \in Z(H^*)$ . Thus the center of  $H^*$  is nontrivial and it suffices to show that  $Z(K^*) = 1$ .

Every element of  $K^*$  not lying in  $V$  acts nontrivially on the subgroup  $V$  of  $K^*$  and do not lie in  $Z(K^*)$ . If there is a nonzero vector  $v$  of  $V$  lying in the center of  $K^*$ , then one-dimensional subspace  $\langle v \rangle$  is invariant under the action of the subgroup  $K$  of  $K^*$  and, therefore,  $K$  is a subgroup of  $H$  up to conjugacy in  $G$ . Since orders of  $H$  and  $K$  coincide, this implies the conjugacy of  $H$  and  $K$  contradicting Lemma 1. Thus  $Z(K^*) = 1$  and the subgroups  $H^*$  and  $K^*$  of  $G^*$  are nonisomorphic.

2. EXAMPLE OF ISOMORPHIC  $p$ -COMPLEMENTS WHICH ARE NOT CONJUGATE IN THE AUTOMORPHISM GROUP

Let  $G$ ,  $H$  and  $K$  be the same groups as in the previous section. Consider the group

$$X = \underbrace{G \times G \times \dots \times G}_{7 \text{ times}}$$

and its automorphism  $\varphi : (g_1, g_2, \dots, g_7) \mapsto (g_2, \dots, g_7, g_1)$ . Denote by  $G^*$  the natural semidirect product of  $X$  and  $\langle \varphi \rangle$ . We have  $G^* \simeq \text{GL}_3(2) \wr \mathbb{Z}_7$ . Let  $H^*$  and  $K^*$  be the subgroups of  $X$ , defined as follows:

$$H^* = \underbrace{H \times H \times \dots \times H}_{7 \text{ times}},$$

$$K^* = K \times \underbrace{H \times \dots \times H}_{6 \text{ times}}.$$

Since  $H$  and  $K$  are isomorphic by Lemma 1,  $H^*$  and  $K^*$  are also isomorphic. Also we have  $|H^*| = |K^*| = (2^3 \cdot 3)^7$  and  $|G^* : H^*| = |G^* : K^*| = 7^8$ , i.e.  $H^*$  and  $K^*$  are 7-complements of  $G^*$ .

Let us find the number of subgroups conjugate to  $H^*$  in  $G^*$ . Since  $H$  is not normal in  $G$  and its index is a prime number, we have  $H = N_G(H)$ . Thus  $G$  contains  $|G : N_G(H)| = 7$  subgroups conjugate to  $H$ . We conclude that  $X$  contains exactly  $7^7$  subgroups conjugate to  $H^*$ . Every such subgroup has the form

$$(H^*)^x = H^{g_1} \times H^{g_2} \times \dots \times H^{g_7},$$

where  $g_1, g_2, \dots, g_7 \in G$  and  $x = (g_1, g_2, \dots, g_7) \in X$ . We have

$$(H^*)^{x\varphi} = (H^{g_1} \times H^{g_2} \times \dots \times H^{g_7})^\varphi = H^{g_2} \times \dots \times H^{g_7} \times H^{g_1} = (H^*)^y,$$

where  $y = x^\varphi = (g_2, \dots, g_7, g_1) \in X$ . Therefore, the conjugacy class of  $H^*$  in  $X$  is invariant under the action of  $\varphi$ , thus there are  $7^7$  subgroups of  $G^*$  conjugate to  $H^*$ .

Let us find the number of subgroups conjugate to  $K^*$  in  $G^*$ . In the same way as before we conclude that  $X$  contains  $7^7$  subgroups conjugate to  $K^*$  and every such subgroup has the form

$$(K^*)^x = K^{g_1} \times H^{g_2} \times \cdots \times H^{g_7},$$

where  $g_1, g_2, \dots, g_7 \in G$  and  $x = (g_1, g_2, \dots, g_7)$ . But in this case the image of  $K^*$  under the action of  $\varphi$  equals the subgroup

$$(K^*)^\varphi = (K \times H \times \cdots \times H)^\varphi = H \times \cdots \times H \times K$$

that is not conjugate to  $K^*$  in  $X$ . Thus  $G^*$  contains more than  $7^7$  subgroups conjugate to  $K^*$  (it is not difficult to see that there are  $7^8$  such subgroups).

So we conclude that the subgroups  $H^*$  and  $K^*$  are not conjugate in the automorphism group of  $G^*$ .

#### REFERENCES

- [1] P. Hall, *A note on soluble groups*, J. London Math. Soc. **3** (1928), 98–105. JFM 54.0145.01
- [2] P. Hall, *A characteristic property of soluble groups*, J. London Math. Soc. **12** (1937), 198–200. Zbl 0016.39204
- [3] S.A. Chunikhin, *On soluble groups*, Isv. NIIMM Tom. Univ., **2** (1938), 220–223 (in Russian).
- [4] I.M. Isaacs, *Finite group theory*, AMS, Providence, RI, 2008. MR2426855
- [5] Z. Arad and E. Fisman, *On finite factorizable groups*, J. Algebra, **86** (1984), 522–548. MR0732264
- [6] Z. Arad and M. B. Ward, *New criteria for the solvability of finite groups*, J. Algebra, **77** (1982), 234–246. MR0665175

ALEKSANDR ALEKSANDROVICH BUTURLAKIN, DANILA OLEGOVICH REVIN  
 SOBOLEV INSTITUTE OF MATHEMATICS,  
 4 ACAD. KOPTYUG AVENUE,  
 630090, NOVOSIBIRSK, RUSSIA  
 NOVOSIBIRSK STATE UNIVERSITY,  
 2 PIROGOVA STR.,  
 630090, NOVOSIBIRSK, RUSSIA  
*E-mail address:* buturlakin@math.nsc.ru, revin@math.nsc.ru